

**REGULAR MEETING
Wednesday, April 9, 2025**

TOUR 2:00 PM

MEETING 4:00 PM

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL - TOUR

The following Commission members were present for the tour: Mel Ahlborn, Stefan Karapetkov, Michael LePage, and Stephanie Locke

The following Commission members were absent: Erin Allen

TOUR OF INSPECTION

- Item A:** **DS 24014 (Lewis & McClellan Trust):** San Carlos Street 3 southwest of Vista Avenue
- Item B:** **DS 24346 (P&T 2024 LLC):** Santa Rita Street 5 southwest of 3rd Avenue
- Item C:** **DS 25089 (Hunter):** Casanova Street 2 northwest of 13th Avenue
- Item D:** **DS 24167/VA 25056 (Bennett):** Northeast corner of Scenic Road and 10th Avenue
- Item E:** **DR 23-140 & LM 20-394 & UP 21-113 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building):** Dolores Street 2 southeast of 7th Avenue

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS

The following Commission members were present: Mel Ahlborn, Stefan Karapetkov, Michael LePage, and Stephanie Locke

The following Commission members were absent: Erin Allen

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Anna Ginette, Director of Community Planning and Building, announced a future agenda item for the May hearing regarding training on findings and evidence for the Commissioners and a draft resolution for better organizing findings

CONSENT AGENDA

- Item 1:** Monthly Activity Report: March 2025
- Item 2:** March 12, 2025 Special Meeting Minutes; March 12, 2025 Regular Meeting Minutes; March 25, 2025 Special Meeting Minutes
- Item 3:** **DS 23-147 (Rodriguez):** Consideration of a Track 1 Design Study Referral for DS 23-147 (Rodriguez) for the after-the-fact installation of a driveway gate and the

addition of stucco and stone veneer to a brick chimney, located at Camino Real 4 northwest of 11th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-275-006-000

Item 4: **DS 24346 (P&T 2024 LLC):** Consideration of a continued Final Design Study and associated Coastal Development Permit for DS 24346 (P&T 2024 LLC) for the demolition of an existing 946-square-foot, one-story single-family residence and 200-square-foot carport, and the construction of a 1,588-square-foot, two-story single-family residence and a 200-square-foot detached garage, located at Santa Rita Street southwest of 3rd Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-029-005-000

Chair LePage opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None

Chair LePage closed the meeting for public comment.

It was moved by Chair LePage and seconded by Commissioner Karapetkov to approve the consent agenda.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Commission Member(s): Ahlborn, Karapetkov, Locke, LePage
NOES:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Commission Member(s): Allen

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

Item 5: **DR 16-384 (Fountain):** Reconsideration of the granting of a Time Extension for Design Review DR 16-384 (Fountain), associated Use Permits, and Coastal Development Permit for the construction of a 1,600-square-foot mixed-use building with a 1,499-square-foot basement and 595-square-foot car pit on a 2,000-square-foot vacant lot, and associated site improvements, located on 8th Avenue 2 northwest of Junipero Avenue in the Residential and Limited Commercial (RC) District. The applicant is formally withdrawing the application that is the subject of the Time Extension.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, reported that the Planning Commission had previously granted a time extension in September 2024. However, Mr. Fountain has since officially withdrawn his request for a time extension. As a result, the entitlements for the mixed-use project have expired, and no further action is required by the Planning Commission.

Chair LePage opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None

Chair LePage closed the meeting for public comment.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Item 6: **DS 25089 (Hunter):** Consideration of a Track 1 Referral for an amendment to a previously approved Design Study (DS 23-208) for amendments to the tree

protection and planting plan including the removal of one Monterey Pine previously proposed to remain. The project is located at Casanova Street 2 northwest of 13th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-281-025-000

Evan Kort, Senior Planner, presented the history of the project, noting that the Design Study was previously approved with the condition of protecting a Monterey pine tree. The revised plan at the time stepped the building foundation away from the tree. However, the City Forester had noted the tree was in decline, and its condition had worsened during construction. Substantial tree roots were identified during grading and foundation work. Staff recommended amending the previously approved Design Study to allow for the tree's removal, subject to a tree replanting requirement.

Justin Ono, City Forester, explained that the exposed roots were very large, and cutting them would cause further decline due to bleeding and beetle infestation. He confirmed the tree was in poor to very poor condition and showed signs of beetle activity.

JR Hunter, Property Owner, spoke on the history of the original Design Study and why the decision was made to attempt to maintain the tree. He reiterated the current recommendation from the City Forester and project planner to remove the tree.

Chair LePage opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: John Watson, Mary Watson, Melanie Billig, Kathleen Boyer, Samuel Pitnick, and Linda Smith

Chair LePage closed the meeting for public comment.

JR Hunter, Property Owner, gave closing remarks and responded to comments made by the public.

Justin Ono, City Forester, answered questions of the Commission on the best location for planting a replacement tree.

It was moved by Chair LePage and seconded by Commissioner Locke to approve a resolution finding the project categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), State CEQA guidelines and local environmental regulations, pursuant to Section 15303 (Class 3) – New Construction and Conversion of Small Structures, and Section 15304 (Class 4) – Minor Alterations to Land and no exceptions to the exemptions contained in Section 15300.2 can be made, and amending a previously approved Design Study (DS 23-208) for amendments to the tree protection and planting plan including the removal of one Monterey pine previously proposed to remain. The project is located at Casanova Street 2 northwest of 13th Avenue in the Single-family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010- 281-025-000 with an amendment to the planting requirement to one upper canopy and two lower canopy trees.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Commission Member(s): Ahlborn, Karapetkov, Locke, LePage
NOES:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Commission Member(s): Allen

Item 7: DS 24167/VA 25056 (Bennett): Consideration of a Combined Concept and Final Design Study (DS 24167), and associated Coastal Development Permit for

substantial alterations to an existing single-family residence, and Variance (VA 25056) for modifications to maximum site coverage regulations located at the northeast corner of Scenic Road and 10th Avenue located in the Single Family Residential (R-Zoning District, Beach and Riparian (BR) Overlay, and Park (P) Overlay. APN: 010-302-006-000

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the staff report on the proposed project and the existing residence, which is non-conforming in terms of floor area and height. She spoke on the landscape lighting and the limitations designated by the Design Guidelines. The scope of work qualifies as a substantial alteration and includes new siding, a new chimney, new windows and doors, a new roof, retaining walls, and changes to site coverage. The City Forester assessed the two cypress trees in the front yard and determined them to be significant trees with defined structural root zones. Staff recommended denial of the variance.

Eric Miller, Architect for the project, addressed the Commission regarding the Variance request and design choices. He announced the withdrawal of the Variance application, stating that they would preserve the existing site coverage because proposed alternatives to meet the site coverage requirements were deemed unsuitable due to accessibility concerns for the homeowner and potential fire safety issues. Mr. Miller clarified the use of split-face stone, indicating that it was not solely for aesthetics but served specific design purposes within the project. He answered the Commission's questions about various aspects of the proposed project.

Chair LePage opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: Kathy Haller

Chair LePage closed the meeting for public comment.

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, responded to comments raised by the Commission regarding lighting, site coverage, and modification to the doors.

Eric Miller, Architect for the project, specified the material to be used for the siding of the house.

It was moved by Commissioner Locke and seconded by Commissioner Ahlbo to approve a resolution finding approval of the project categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to CEQA guidelines Section 15301 and that none of the exceptions to the exemptions listed in Section 15300.2 apply in this case; approving a combined Concept and Final Design Study (DS 24167); approving a Coastal Development Permit for substantial alterations to an existing single-family residence. The project is located at the northeast corner of Scenic Road and of 10th Avenue located in the Single-family Residential (R-1) Zoning District, Beach and Riparian (BR) Overlay, and Park (P) Overlay. APN: 010-302-006-000 with the added conditions of not increasing the amount of lighting on the house, specifying the withdrawal of the application for a variance in site coverage and as such all nonconforming site coverage must not be increased or reorganized, and the removal of condition 36 regarding siding.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Commission Member(s): Ahlborn, Locke, LePage
NOES:	Commission Member(s): Karapetkov
ABSTAINED:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Commission Member(s): Allen

Item 8: DS 24014 & VA 24364 (Lewis & McClellan Trust): Consideration of a Track 1

Design Study referral and associated Variance for the construction of a 39-square-foot addition to the existing residence and a 200-square-foot parking pad in the front setback located on San Carlos Street 3 southwest of Vista Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN: 010-116-019-000

Jacob Olander, Associate Planner, presented the existing site plan with the driveway and garage. The applicant proposed the removal of some site coverage to accommodate the new construction. The Variance was requested due to the parking pad being located in the front setback. Staff recommended denial of the Variance.

Adam Jeselnick, Architect for the project, presented the project's design objectives and addressed the need for a Variance. He explained that his clients sought to convert the existing garage into livable space to create a more functional first floor. The clients also desired to modify the existing bathroom, add a small powder room, relocate the laundry, and unify both interior finishes and exterior materials while maintaining the integrity of the cottage's appearance without adding a second story. To address the parking situation while converting the garage, the proposal included a 200-foot parking pad in the front setback, requiring a Variance. He answered questions from the Commission regarding the existing property levels and how the proposed design is integrated with the site.

Michael Lewis, Property Owner, provided background on the purpose of their project.

Chair LePage opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None

Chair LePage closed the meeting for public comment.

It was moved by Chair LePage and seconded by Commissioner Ahlborn to approve a resolution finding denial of the project statutorily exempt from CEQA pursuant to CEQA guidelines Section 15270(a); and denying a Track 1 Design Study Referral and Variance for the construction of a 39-square-foot addition to an existing residence, the conversion of the existing garage into living space, and the construction of a parking pad in the front setback. The property located on San Carlos Street 3 southwest of Vista Avenue within the Single-family Residential (R-1) Zoning District, APN 010-116-019-000.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Commission Member(s): Ahlborn, Karapetkov, Locke, LePage
NOES:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Commission Member(s): Allen

Item 9: UP 24288 (The Big Squeezy): Consideration of a Use Permit, UP 24288 (The Big Squeezy), for the establishment of a new Specialty Restaurant serving juice and smoothies located on Lincoln Street 3 southwest of Ocean in Unit #1 in the Central Commercial (CC) District. APN: 010-191-001-000

Jacob Olander, Associate Planner, presented the proposal for a new Specialty Restaurant that would have 14 interior seats and focus on juices and smoothies. Staff noted the need for a water permit and potentially an amendment to the Use Permit for Katie's Cottage (UP 87176) regarding seating. Concerns about formula food restaurants were also discussed.

Ash Shoukry, Business Owner, addressed the Commission, making himself available for questions.

Chair LePage opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: None

Chair LePage closed the meeting for public comment.

It was moved by Commissioner Locke and seconded by Chair LePage to approve a resolution finding the project exempt from environmental review pursuant to CEQA guidelines Section 15301 and that none of the exceptions to the exemptions contained in section 15300.2 can be made in this case; and approving a Use Permit for the establishment of a new specialty restaurant, "The Big Squeezy by the Sea", with 14 indoor seats. The property is located on Lincoln Street 3 southwest of Ocean Avenue (Building A; Suite #2) in the Central Commercial (CC) District. APN: 010-191-001-000 with the condition to obtain a water permit and a Use Permit amendment for additional seating.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Commission Member(s): Ahlborn, Karapetkov, Locke, LePage
NOES:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Commission Member(s): Allen

RECESS 6:19-6:30

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL – CHAMBERS

The following Commission members were present: Mel Ahlborn, Stefan Karapetkov, Michael LePage, and Stephanie Locke

The following Commission members were absent: Erin Allen

Item 10: DR 23-140 & LM 20-394 & UP 21-113 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building): Consideration of a Design Review, DR 23-140 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building), Use Permit, UP 21-113 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building), Lot Merger, LM 20-394 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building), and Coastal Development Permit for the construction of a new 12,971-square-foot, two-story mixed-use development with 8 apartment units and approximately 5,100 square feet of new commercial floor area, with a new 852-square-foot basement and a new surface parking area at the rear of the property with a total of 12 parking spaces with 10 of the 12 spaces sharing a parking a parking lift system and the remaining required parking being provided through the city's in-lieu parking program. The existing community room and ornamented concrete wall (part of the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex) are proposed to remain on the project site as part of the project. The total project floor area including that of the existing community room (existing and proposed structures) is 13,663 square feet. The project is located at Dolores Street 2 southeast of 7th Avenue in the Service Commercial (SC) District at Lots 6, 8, and 10 of Block 91. APNs: 010-145-023-000, 010-145-024-000, and 010-145-012-000.

Evan Kort, Senior Planner, presented revised renderings for the proposed two-story mixed-use development on Dolores Street. The project includes eight apartment units and commercial space. Staff reviewed the history of the project, including reviews by the Historic Resources

Board and City Council, and the conditions of approval related to the preservation buffer for the historic structure on the site. Staff recommended approval of the Lot Merger, Design Review, Coastal Development Permit, and Use Permit. Correspondence received regarding the project was noted.

Jun Sillano, Architect for the project, presented videos to illustrate the project, including a fly-through/walk-through as requested at the previous hearing and a car lift demonstration to show the operation for residential tenants. He detailed the inspiration behind the Spanish Revival design, emphasizing the intent to adhere to commercial guidelines and create a purist style that respects and enhances the historical character of the site and its surroundings. He referenced historical and current images of Spanish Revival and Mediterranean architecture, pointing to elements like parapet walls, eave lines, corbels, and balconies with rot iron railings. Mr. Sillano addressed the interconnection of the buildings, clarifying that the proposal comprised three buildings separated by an egress walkway. He also discussed the shade impact of the proposed construction on neighboring structures, specifically noting the 4-foot setback from the east neighbor and the strategic placement of windows with secured and offset glass to minimize impacts on the existing apartment building. Mr. Sillano addressed the building size, stating it was under allowable FAR and lot coverage and designed to create a feeling of smaller buildings without blank walls. He reiterated their compliance with regulations and directions received over the past six years of review by the Historic Resources Board and City Council.

Chair LePage opened the meeting for public comment. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: Steve Hillyard, Lee Morcus, Ian Martin, Julianne Christopher, Karyl Hall, Ken White, Andi Carr, Kristi Reimers, Cindy Llyod, Neal Kruse, Karen Ferlito, Lindamarie Rosier, Rich Pepe, Anonymous, Tim O'Shea

Chair LePage closed the meeting for public comment.

The architect, Jun Sillano, addressed the Commission and public comments, emphasizing compliance with the preservation buffer and previous approvals.

Anna Ginette, Director of Community Planning and Building, addressed the Commission on several legal and practical considerations concerning the suggestion of requiring an easement for public access through the property. She explained the concept of nexus, stating that while the applicant could voluntarily offer an easement, the Commission could not legally require it without a supporting policy. Similarly, regarding the protection of views from private properties in the commercial district, Director Ginette pointed out that while there are protections for public views, there is no policy in place that allows the Commission to require the applicant to make adjustments solely to preserve private views. Again, she noted that the applicant could choose to make voluntary changes, but the Commission's ability to mandate such changes is limited by the lack of a relevant policy. She also addressed the topic of balconies, emphasizing that the balconies in question are considered a means of emergency egress for the second-floor residential units. This aspect would need to be taken into consideration if any modifications to the balconies were proposed.

James Siliano answered questions of the Commission on parking requirements.

Ryan Aeschilman, the representative for the applicant addressed the topic of underground utilities. They indicated a desire to work with PG&E to underground the power lines, acknowledging that the existing overhead lines were visually unappealing and would detract from the project's aesthetics. Mr. Aeschilman also explained the rationale behind the basement-level bathrooms. They clarified that the elevator had been extended to the basement level to ensure ADA accessibility to these restrooms. Additionally, they pointed out that the number of

bathrooms provided was dictated by building code requirements and were intended to be accessible to the public, not solely for the use of tenants within the commercial spaces.

It was moved by Commissioner Locke and seconded by Chair LePage to approve a resolution finding the subject project categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), State CEQA guidelines and local environmental regulations, pursuant to Section 15332 (Class 32) – In-fill Development and no exceptions to the exemption contained in Section 15300.2 can be made; and approving Design Review, DR 23-140 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building), Use Permit, UP 21-113 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building), Lot Merger, LM 20-394 (Esperanza Carmel Commercial - JB Pastor Building), and associated Coastal Development Permit for the construction of a new 12,971-square-foot, two-story mixed-use development with 8 apartment units and approximately 5,794 square feet of new commercial floor area, with a new 852-square-foot basement and a new surface parking area at the rear of the property with a total of 12 parking spaces with 10 of the 12 spaces sharing a parking a parking lift system and the remaining required parking being provided through the City's In-lieu Parking Program. The existing community room and ornamented concrete wall (part of the Northern California Savings and Loan Complex) are proposed to remain on the project site as part of the project. The total project floor area including that of the existing community room (existing and proposed structures) is 13,663 square feet. The project is located at Dolores Street 2 southeast of 7th Avenue in the Service Commercial (SC) District at Lots 6, 8, and 10 of Block 91. APNs: 010-145-023-000, 010-145-024-000, and 010-145-012-000.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Commission Member(s): Ahlborn, Karapetkov, Locke, LePage
NOES:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Commission Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Commission Member(s): Allen

DIRECTORS REPORT

Anna Ginette, Director of Community Planning and Building, gave a report and answered questions of the Commission.

- **City Council Appeals:** Staff provided an update on four appeals that went before the City Council regarding previous Planning Commission decisions. All four appeals resulted in the City Council overturning or modifying the Planning Commission's decisions.
- **Updated Fire Hazard Severity Zone Maps:** Staff announced a discussion on updated fire hazard severity zone maps at the May City Council hearing, noting that the maps are available for public review.
- **Roofing Materials:** Staff provided an update on the requested zinc roofing samples and the potential adoption of a roofing materials policy, anticipating a draft policy in June.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Item 11: **Next Regular Meeting:** May 14, 2025

ADJOURNMENT

9:08 PM

APPROVED:



Michael LePage, Chair

ATTEST:



Shelby Gorman, Recording Secretary