



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Jordan Chroman, Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl
Hall, Kathy Pomeroy

All meetings are held in the City Council Chambers
East Side of Monte Verde Street
Between Ocean and 7th Avenues

REGULAR MEETING Monday, May 15, 2023

MEETING 4:00 PM

THIS MEETING WILL BE HELD VIA TELECONFERENCE AND IN PERSON AT CITY HALL.

To attend in person, visit the City Council Chambers at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and Seventh Avenues. Seating will be limited and available on a first-come, first-served basis. To participate via teleconference, click the following link to attend via Zoom (or copy and paste the link into your browser): <https://ci-carmel-ca-us.zoom.us/j/88991263922?pwd=TFVQTUFVMjA5c1I2STdDQU94V1I0UT09>. To attend Zoom via telephone, dial +1 312 626 6799. Meeting ID: 889 9126 3922. Passcode: 930 359.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

Members of the public are entitled to speak on matters of municipal concern not on the agenda during Public Appearances. Each person's comments shall be limited to 3 minutes, or as otherwise established by the Chair. Matters not appearing on the agenda will not receive action at this meeting and may be referred to staff. Persons are not required to provide their names, and it is helpful for speakers to state their names so they may be identified in the minutes of the meeting.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

CONSENT AGENDA

Items on the consent agenda are routine in nature and do not require discussion or independent action. Members of the Board or the public may ask that any items be considered individually for purposes of Board discussion and/ or for public comment. Unless that is done, one motion may be used to adopt all recommended actions.

1. Adoption of Minutes: February 27, 2023 Special Meeting
2. Adoption of Minutes: March 20, 2023 Regular Meeting

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

3. Consider amending the Historic Resources Board Rules of Procedure to convene meetings on-site at the location of the first item on the Tour of Inspection.
4. Revised proposal from Historic Resources Board Member Karyl Hall for a new City policy to protect selected non-historic Carmel homes from demolition/exterior remodeling.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

5. Next Regular Meeting: June 19, 2023

ADJOURNMENT

6. PUBLIC CORRESPONDENCE: Items on the Agenda
7. PUBLIC CORRESPONDENCE: Additional Items Not Associated with Items on the Agenda

This agenda was posted at City Hall, Monte Verde Street between Ocean Avenue and 7th Avenue, Harrison Memorial Library, located on the NE corner of Ocean Avenue and Lincoln Street, the Carmel-by-the-Sea Post Office, 5th Avenue between Dolores Street and San Carlos Street, and the City's webpage <http://www.ci.carmel.ca.us> in accordance with applicable legal requirements.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

Any supplemental writings or documents distributed to a majority of the Historic Resources Board regarding any item on this agenda, received after the posting of the agenda will be available at City Hall located on Monte Verde Street between Ocean and Seventh Avenues during regular business hours.

SPECIAL NOTICES TO PUBLIC

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 831-620-2000 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

May 15, 2023
CONSENT AGENDA

TO: Historic Resources Board Commissioners

SUBMITTED BY: Leah Young, Administrative Coordinator

SUBJECT: Adoption of Minutes: February 27, 2023 Special Meeting

RECOMMENDATION:

Adoption of Minutes: February 27, 2023 Special Meeting

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

N/A

FISCAL IMPACT:

N/A

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: February 27, 2023 Special Meeting Minutes

**SPECIAL MEETING
Monday, February 27, 2023
4:00 p.m.**

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

The following members of the Board were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, Kathy Pomeroy, and Jordan Chroman.

The following members of the Board were absent: None.

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

ANNOUNCEMENTS – Part 1

Board Member Hall addressed some inaccuracies in The Carmel Pine Cone regarding the “Level 2 Proposal” that was discussed in the previous Board meeting.

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: None.

CONSENT AGENDA

Item 1: Certified Local Government Annual Report 2021-2022

Marnie R. Waffle, AICP, Principal Planner, gave a high-level overview of the report and addressed questions of the Board.

It was moved by Board Member Pomeroy and seconded by Board Member Dyar to adopt the Consent Agenda.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman
NOES:	Board Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Board Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Board Member(s): None

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

Item A: Nielsen Market Map Board: Consideration of a Historic Evaluation Phase 1 Determination of Ineligibility for the Nielsen Market Map Board located at the northeast corner of San Carlos Street and 7th Avenue in the Central Commercial (CC) District. APN 010-141-004

Marnie R. Waffle, AICP, Principal Planner, presented the Staff Report and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the public hearing. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Janice Bradner.

The public hearing was closed.

It was moved by Board Member Pomeroy and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to consider the map of exceptional importance and consider it historic, even though it is less than 50 years old, based on the following findings: it is the only public piece in the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea by Bill Bates, Bill Bates was the primary illustrator, the map is a unique resource, and a map board has been there over 50 years.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman
NOES:	Board Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Board Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Board Member(s): None

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Item 1: DS 23-006 (Sweet Trust): Consideration of a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Design Study application, DS 23-006 (Sweet Trust), for the demolition and reconstruction of a detached garage at the southwest corner of Casanova Street and 11th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN 010-273-001

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the Staff Report and addressed questions of the Board.

Justin Pauly, Architect, commented on a few aspects of the project, including some of the existing historical information, and answered questions of the Board and the public.

Chair Chroman opened the public hearing. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Nancy Twomey.

The public hearing was closed.

It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt a Resolution issuing a Determination of Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the demolition of an existing 483-square-foot detached garage and storage room and construction of a new 200-square-foot detached garage at the historic "Reginald Markham House" property located at the southwest corner of Casanova Street and 11th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN 010-273-001

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Board Member(s): Dyar, Goodhue, Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman
NOES:	Board Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Board Member(s): None
ABSENT:	Board Member(s): None

Board Member Dyar recused himself from Item 2: HE 22-294 (Schneider).

Item 2: HE 22-294 (Schneider): Consideration of a Historic Evaluation Phase I Determination of Eligibility referral, HE 22-294 (Schneider), for the "Gard House" at the southwest corner of Mission Street and 12th Avenue in the Single-Family Residential (R-1) District. APN 010-163-001

Katherine Wallace, Associate Planner, presented the Staff Report and addressed questions of the Board.

Tobin Schneider, Property Owner, commented on his intentions for the project in conjunction with historical considerations.

Kent Seavey, Historic Resource Consultant representing Property Owner Tobin Schneider, commented on the historical eligibility of the property, based on his research and findings.

Anthony Kirk, Architectural Historian representing Property Owner Tobin Schneider, commented on the historical elements of the project, based on his research and including the findings referenced in the most recent historic evaluation.

Chair Chroman opened the public hearing. The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Sam Schneider.

The public hearing was closed.

After some discussion by the Board, an alternate motion was proposed by Board Member Pomeroy.

It was moved by Board Member Pomeroy and seconded by Chair Chroman to determine the "Gard House" ineligible to be placed on the Carmel Inventory of Historic Resources based on the following findings: no one important lived there, there is no architect of record, the house has been altered, and there are better examples of Craftsman cottage architecture in the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea. APN 010-163-001

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Board Member(s): Hall, Pomeroy, Chroman
NOES:	Board Member(s): Goodhue
ABSTAINED:	Board Member(s): Dyar (recused)
ABSENT:	Board Member(s): None

ANNOUNCEMENTS – Part 2

Marnie R. Waffle, AICP, Principal Planner welcomed Board Member Dyar to his first meeting after resigning as the Chair several months ago.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave the Director's Report and addressed questions of the Board.

- **Housing Ad Hoc Committee:** Community meeting scheduled at City Hall Council Chambers for tomorrow, February 28, 2023, at 5:30 p.m.; all Board members and members of the public were encouraged to attend and participate in person or online via Zoom.

- **Design Traditions 1.5 Project:** Updated Draft has been released for public review, effective February 9, 2023; copies on drafts may be found on the City's website at this link: <https://ci.carmel.ca.us/post/long-range-planning-initiatives>. The Steering Committee will be meeting in the City Hall Council Chambers this coming Wednesday, March 1, 2023, at 9:00 a.m.; the public was encouraged to participate and provided input. A community meeting will be scheduled in the near future, but no date has yet been determined.
- **Planning Commission:** A Special Meeting to receive public input on the Wireless Ordinance Draft has been scheduled to be held in the City Hall Council Chambers on March 15, 2023 at 4:00 p.m. All members of the public are welcome to join in person or virtually via Zoom.

ANNOUNCEMENTS – Part 3

Board Member Dyar introduced the second lecture in the AIA Lecture Series in Sand City, CA that will address housing needs in the State of California; the next meeting will be held on March 16, 2023 at 6:00 p.m. The first lecture, as well as additional information about California's housing policies, can be found online at this link: <https://aiamontereybay.org/>.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Item 3: Next Regular Meeting: March 20, 2023

ADJOURNMENT.

5:20 p.m.

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

Jordan Chroman, Chair

Leah R. Young, Recording Secretary



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

May 15, 2023
CONSENT AGENDA

TO: Historic Resources Board Commissioners

SUBMITTED BY: Leah Young, Administrative Coordinator

SUBJECT: Adoption of Minutes: March 20, 2023 Regular Meeting

RECOMMENDATION:

Adoption of Minutes: March 20, 2023 Regular Meeting

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

N/A

FISCAL IMPACT:

N/A

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: March 20, 2023 Regular Meeting Minutes

REGULAR MEETING
Monday, March 20, 2023
4:00 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

The following members of the Board were present: Erik Dyar, Esther Goodhue, Karyl Hall, and Jordan Chroman.

The following members of the Board were absent: Kathy Pomeroy.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

The following members of the public appeared before the Board: Joe DiNucci.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

CONSENT AGENDA

Item 1: Adoption of Minutes: January 23, 2023 Special Meeting

Item 2: Adoption of Minutes: December 19, 2022 Regular Meeting

It was moved by Board Member Hall and seconded by Board Member Goodhue to adopt the Consent Agenda.

The motion passed by the following roll call vote:

AYES:	Board Member(s): Goodhue, Hall, Chroman
NOES:	Board Member(s): None
ABSTAINED:	Board Member(s): Dyar
ABSENT:	Board Member(s): Pomeroy

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

Item A: Revised proposal from Historic Resources Board Member Karyl Hall for a new City policy to protect selected non-historic Carmel homes from demolition/exterior remodeling.

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave a brief overview of the proposal and then referred the presentation to Board Member Hall.

Board Member Hall gave a presentation and addressed questions of the Board.

Chair Chroman opened the public hearing. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: Nancy Twomey, David O'Neil, Joe DiNucci, and Lucinda Lloyd.

The public hearing was closed.

The Board engaged in discussion about Board Member Hall's presentation and addressed various issues associated therewith.

Chair Chroman opened the public hearing. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: David O'Neil.

The public hearing was closed.

The Board continued their discussion about Board Member Hall's presentation and addressed various issues associated therewith.

Chair Chroman opened the public hearing. The following members of the public appeared before the Commission: David O'Neil.

The public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed options to move this project forward in accordance with City Council's priorities. Another option discussed was to add the Level 2 Proposal as a supplemental item to the already-existing Design Traditions 1.5 Steering Committee project.

The final direction of the discussion included a consensus for Board Member Hall to make further revisions and to present the updated proposal to the Board at the next scheduled meeting.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Marnie Waffle, Principal Planner, gave a report and addressed questions of the Board.

- **Capital Improvement Program (CIP):** Special meeting scheduled for tomorrow, March 21, 2023, at 4:00 p.m.; City Council will meet and discuss projects funded, including a new roof for City Hall, the repair of a retaining wall at City Hall, exterior painting at the Harrison Memorial Library, and window repairs at the Sunset Center cottages located at the south end of the Sunset Center property.
- **Wireless Ordinance Draft:** The Public Workshop meeting was cancelled last week, due to storms and power outages. The meeting has been rescheduled for March 29, 2023 at 4:00 p.m. The Planning Commission will be reviewing the Draft Wireless Ordinance and receiving feedback from the public; no decisions will be made.
- **Design Traditions 1.5 Project:** The Steering Committee will be holding a meeting on March 22, 2023 at 9:00 a.m.; the meeting will be held at City Hall and is open to the public.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Item 3: Next Regular Meeting: April 17, 2023

Item 4: Level 2 Proposal Continued Discussion

ADJOURNMENT

5:56 p.m.

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

Jordan Chroman, Chair

Leah R. Young, Recording Secretary



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

May 15, 2023
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO: Historic Resources Board Commissioners

SUBMITTED BY: Marnie R. Waffle, AICP, Principal Planner

SUBJECT: Consider amending the Historic Resources Board Rules of Procedure to convene meetings on-site at the location of the first item on the Tour of Inspection.

RECOMMENDATION:

Amend the Historic Resources Board Rules of Procedure to convene meetings on-site at the location of the first item on the Tour of Inspection.

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

Currently, the Historic Resources Board Rules of Procedure state that Board meetings will be convened at City Hall, and then proceed onto the Tour of Inspection. During the Covid-19 pandemic, the Board began convening the meeting at the first location listed on the Tour of Inspection agenda. This practice started because the public hearing portion of the meeting was being held virtually via Zoom, rather than in person.

When the Board resumed in-person meetings following the Covid-19 pandemic, the practice of convening at the location of the first tour stop was continued. An unintended benefit of this practice that was not realized during the pandemic, is that convening in the field actually saves time that was being spent to gather at City Hall, and then mobilize the Board and the public to the first site.

The Planning Commission adopted a similar amendment to their Rules of Procedure on May 10, 2023. In an effort to be consistent and take advantage of the time savings, staff is recommending officially modifying the Rules of Procedure to reflect current practice. The proposed amendment can be found in Attachment 1.

FISCAL IMPACT:

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1 - HRB Rules of Procedure rev05.15.2023

CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD RULES OF PROCEDURE

I. ORGANIZATION AND OFFICERS**A. Organization**

The Historic Resources Board shall consist of five members, residents of Carmel-by-the-Sea, and appointed by the City Council. In the event that no elector with the required expertise can be found, the appointee may be a resident outside the City limits. In any event, a majority of the Board shall at all times be composed of electors of the City. All members shall serve at the pleasure of the City Council. Any member may be removed from the Board upon a majority vote of the City Council.

B. Duties and Powers of the Historic Resources Board

The purpose of the Board is to carry out the policies of the architectural/cultural/historic (ACH) element of the General Plan and to serve in an advisory capacity to the Planning Commission and City Council. Duties of the Board shall be as follows:

1. To administer the historic preservation program pursuant to this chapter.
2. To review, and approve, deny or approve with conditions, determinations of consistency with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for all major alterations involving historic resources.
3. To administer the Carmel Inventory and the Carmel Register.
4. To approve or deny requests submitted by owners of identified historic resources to place the resources on the Carmel Register.
5. To approve or deny requests to remove resources from the Carmel Inventory and/or the Carmel Register.
6. To advise the Planning Commission and the City Council on amendments to the Historic Context Statement, Historic Preservation Ordinance and the provisions of the General Plan related to historic resources.
7. To advise the Planning Commission and the City Council on the establishment of historic districts.
8. To advise the City Council on becoming a certified local government for purposes of historic preservation.

9. To advise the Planning Commission on the adequacy of environmental documents involving potential impacts to identified historic resources.
10. To advise the City Council on proposed Mills Act contracts and proposed tax credit applications.
11. To hear appeals of actions by staff to approve or deny determinations of consistency for minor alterations and/or track one projects affecting historic resources.
12. To hear appeals of any administrative determination that a property is not eligible for the Carmel Inventory and to reverse where necessary such determinations, thereby placing such properties on the inventory.
13. To develop historic resource interpretive programs that will foster greater understanding of, and appreciation for, historic resources including Carmel's origins and history.
14. To review and advise the City Council periodically on updating the Historic Context Statement.

C. Officers

1. Selection

- a. A Chairman and Vice-Chairman shall be elected annually from among the Board's membership at the beginning of the annual meeting to serve at the pleasure of the Board. The annual meeting shall be scheduled for the December meeting.
- b. The elections process commences with individual Board Members nominating candidates until a motion is made, seconded and approved to close nominations. At the conclusion of any discussion, the roll is called alphabetically and each Board Member votes for one of the nominated candidates until one is elected by simple majority. The newly elected or reelected Chairman takes the Chair's seat and repeats this process for the Vice Chairman.
- c. The Vice-Chairman shall succeed the Chairman if he/she vacated his/her office before his/her term is completed, the Vice-Chairman to serve the unexpired term of the vacated office. A new Vice Chairman shall be elected at the next regular meeting.
- d. In the absence of the Chairman and Vice-Chairman, any other member shall call the Board to order, whereupon a Chairman shall be elected from the members present to preside.

- e. The terms of office of the Chairman and Vice-Chairman shall not exceed two (2) consecutive terms.

2. Responsibilities

The responsibilities and powers of the officers of the Historic Resources Board shall be as follows:

- a. Chairman

- i. Preside at all meetings of the Board.
- ii. Call special meetings of the Board.
- iii. Sign all documents of the Board.
- iv. See that all actions of the Board are properly taken.

- b. Vice-Chairman

During the absence, disability, or disqualification of the Chairman the Vice-Chairman shall exercise or perform all the duties and be subject to all responsibilities of the Chairman.

- c. Ad Hoc Boards And Sub-Boards

The Chairman may appoint Ad Hoc Boards and Sub-Boards to study matters coming before the Board, provided such appointments and the purpose of such Board are made a matter of record in the minutes of the Board.

- i. Sub-Board appointments and a designated staff member are to be made by the Chairman and Planning Director respectively and announced at a regular Historic Resources Board meeting so that the appointments will be documented in the minutes.
- ii. Sub-Boards established for a single, limited purpose and duration shall be considered Ad Hoc and therefore not subject to the Brown Act.
- iii. Sub-Boards are to work with assigned staff and prepare Sub-Board work products or review the research and draft text prepared by staff.

- iv. The first task of each Sub-Board is to prepare a Scope of Work report for Board approval which describes the issue to be addressed, the tasks and process to be used and the anticipated work products.
- v. All Sub-Board meetings are to be conducted at City Hall unless a larger venue is required (for public workshops, etc.) or when field trips are required.
- vi. Sub-Boards shall make monthly oral progress reports to the full Board at regular meetings.

II. CONDUCT OF MEETINGS

A. Rules of Order

Except as otherwise stated in these Rules of Procedure or Municipal Code, Roberts Rules of Order, Newly Revised shall be used as a guide to the conduct of the meetings of the Historic Resources Board, provided, however, that the failure of the Board to conform to said rules of order shall not, in any instance, be deemed to invalidate the action taken.

B. Individual Meetings

Individual meetings between Board Members and applicants of pending requests outside the public meeting of the Historic Resources Board is discouraged.

C. Public Meetings

All meetings of the Historic Resources Board and Boards of the Historic Resources Board shall be held in full compliance with the provisions of the Brown Act (California Government Code, Section 54954.2), the Municipal Code, and these Rules of Procedure.

D. Regular Meetings

1. Regular meetings shall be held on the third Monday of each month in the Council Chambers of City Hall unless otherwise determined by the Board. Public Hearings shall commence at 4:00 P.M. or as soon as thereafter as possible unless otherwise determined by the Board and conclude no later than 8:00 P.M. The Tour of Inspection shall be scheduled prior to the Public Hearings at a time determined to be necessary based on the length of the Tour.

2. Whenever a regular meeting falls on a public holiday, no regular meeting shall be held on that day. Such regular meeting may be rescheduled to another business day or canceled by motion adopted by the Historic Resources Board.

E. Adjourned Meetings

In the event it is the wish of the Historic Resources Board to adjourn its meeting to a certain hour on another day, a specific date, time and place must be set by the Board prior to the regular motion to adjourn.

F. Special Meetings

Special meetings for the purposes of conducting study sessions or workshops may be held at any time upon the call of the Chairman or by a majority of the voting members of the Board or upon request of the City Council following at least twenty-four hours notice to each Board member and to the press. The time and place of the special meeting shall be determined by the convening authority.

G. Annual Meeting

An annual meeting shall be held at the beginning of the first regular meeting of December each year for the purposes of electing a Chairman and Vice-Chairman and for transacting such other business pertaining to the organization and procedures of the Board as may be appropriate.

H. Tours of Inspection

The Tour of Inspection shall include all project sites listed on the agenda. The Tour shall commence at the location of the first item listed on the Tour of Inspection. The Historic Resources Board may determine at the beginning of ~~the tour each meeting (prior to departing on the Tour of Inspection)~~ that one or more site visits listed on the agenda are not necessary. All Historic Resources Board members shall participate in the Tour of Inspection in order to be fully informed of the application site conditions.

The intent of the tour is to provide a visual sense of the topic matter. Upon arrival at the site, staff will present a brief report highlighting particular relevant information and respond to questions. Members of the public may attend the tour. A thorough review and discussion of the topic matter, including public comment, will take place at City Hall.

I. Agenda

1. An agenda for each meeting of the Board shall be prepared by the Director of Community Planning and Building. The Chair, Vice-Chair and Planning Director shall

review the order of the agenda to ensure that those items of highest interest to the general public are placed at the front of the agenda. The number of applications to be considered on the agenda will be determined based on the nature and complexities of the projects, other priorities in the Historic Resources Board's work program and what can reasonably be considered in a two-and-one-half-hour meeting.

2. The agenda for all regularly scheduled meetings shall be posted seventy-two (72) hours in advance.
3. All agendas shall be posted at City Hall, in the Library, and at the Post Office and extra copies placed in the Historic Resources Board bin at the Post Office.
4. The agenda for a special meeting shall be posted twenty-four (24) hours in advance and at the same locations as for regularly scheduled meetings.
5. Each agenda shall contain a brief description of the item to be discussed.
6. Any item may be placed on a future agenda when requested by two Historic Resources Board Members.

J. Order of Meeting

1. The order of items shall be based on the complexity and importance of the items. Generally, the order of business shall be as follows:
 - a. The Chairman shall take the chair at the hour appointed for the meeting and call the meeting to order.
 - b. Members present and absent shall be recorded.
 - c. The Board shall conduct a Tour of Inspection.
 - d. The Chairman shall lead those present in the pledge of allegiance to the flag.
 - e. Public appearances. Comments from the audience will be received on any item not before the Historic Resources Board.
 - f. Extraordinary Business. Any special presentations, awards, resolutions of Appreciation or other matters of community interest shall be conducted.
 - g. The Board shall consider the Regular Consent Agenda.

- h. The Board shall then hear and act upon those proposals scheduled for consideration on a Public Hearing Consent Agenda.
 - i. The Board shall consider any items pulled from the Regular and Public Hearing Consent Agendas.
 - l. Between 6:00 and 6:30 p.m. the Board may recess for fifteen minutes. No recess shall occur except between scheduled agenda items.
 - m. All other applications not requiring public hearing shall then be heard. No action can be taken on items unless they appear on the agenda. (California Government Code, Section 54954.2).
 - n. Any matters of administration of the Board, monthly sub-board reports, determinations and appeals of administrative determinations shall be brought forward.
 - o. Adjournment. The Historic Resources Board will adjourn no later than 8:00 p.m. unless by a majority vote the Board elects to continue. All items not receiving action shall be continued to the next regular meeting or to a special meeting.
2. The following shall be the order of procedure for public hearings concerning planning and zoning matters:
- a. The Chairman shall announce the subject of the public hearing as advertised.
 - b. If a request is made for continuance, a motion may be made and voted upon to continue the public hearing to a definite time and date.
 - c. The staff shall be asked to present the substance of the application, staff or Board report and recommendation, and to answer questions of the Board. Any letters received before the hearing are entered into the record.
 - d. The Chairman shall open the public hearing.
 - e. Order of testimony. The order of testimony shall be as follows.

The Chair can establish shorter speaking times prior to each public hearing if the length of the Agenda or the number of speakers to be heard so warrants.

- i. Applicant's statement (10 minutes).
- ii. Public input on the issue being heard (3 minutes per speaker).

- iii. Applicant (3 minutes).
- iv. Public hearing is closed.
- f. The Board shall then deliberate and either determine the matter or continue to another date and time certain. The Board may ask questions of the applicant without re-opening the hearing to all speakers. The public hearing must be reopened if a new issue is raised. If the public hearing is reopened, all interested parties shall be heard.
- g. If a motion is made and seconded that would alter a project or add new conditions not contained in the written staff report, the Chairman shall allow the applicant to state for the record whether such change is accepted or opposed by the applicant prior to a vote being taken. The Board may then approve or reject the motion.

3. Rules of Testimony

- a. Persons are not required to give their name or address, but it is helpful for speakers to state their name in order that the Secretary may identify them in the minutes of the meeting.
- b. If there are numerous people in the audience who wish to participate on the issue, and it is known that all represent the same opinion, a spokesperson should be encouraged to speak for the entire group. The

spokesperson will then have the opportunity of speaking for a reasonable length of time and of presenting a complete case.
- c. The Chairman may limit the time of testimony to not more than three minutes on a particular issue by each individual.
- d. No person or Board Member shall address the Board without first securing the permission of the Chair to do so.
- e. All comments shall be addressed to the Board as a whole. All questions shall be placed through the Chair.
- f. The Chairman may re-open the hearing for public testimony at any time for the purpose of obtaining new information. It is not necessary to reopen a public hearing to ask questions of the project applicant.

4. Items may be continued by the Historic Resources Board for the following reason:

- a. The application was incomplete.
- b. The applicant could not appear at the meeting and has requested that the item be continued.
- c. The application is revised by the applicant during the meeting.
- d. The Historic Resources Board requires additional information during the meeting.
- e. New information or issues come to light during the meeting that need further study.
- f. The Historic Resources Board requests that the application be revised.

K. Voting

1. Voting Requirements

- a. A quorum shall consist of three (3) members of the Board.
- b. The affirmative vote of a majority of the Board present is necessary to take any action.
- c. When a member disqualifies him/herself from voting because of a potential conflict of interest, the Board Member shall be considered absent from the meeting.
- d. Should the number of Board Members abstaining for a conflict of interest together with absences for other reasons disrupt the quorum, the issue shall be continued to the next regular meeting. When the number of Board Members abstaining solely for a conflict of interest disrupts the quorum and there exists no alternative source for decision, participation by a member with conflict shall be allowed pursuant to California Government Section 87100 et seq.

2. Disqualification From Voting

- a. A Board Member shall disqualify him/herself from debate, discussion and voting on any matter before the Board when there is an appearance of a conflict of interest. When a person disqualifies him/herself prior to the consideration of such matter by the Board, the Board Member shall state that he/she is disqualifying

him/herself due to a conflict of interest, shall state the conflict, and then leave the voting area.

- b. If a Board Member is in doubt as to whether or not a conflict of interest exists, the matter of conflict shall be referred to the City Attorney for his opinion.
- c. The Secretary of the Historic Resources Board shall record in the minutes the time when a Historic Resources Board Member steps down and when he/she returns to the podium.

3. Abstentions

A Board Member may be permitted to abstain from voting because of unpreparedness on an issue before the Board. All votes of a member who disqualifies him/herself shall be recorded as an abstention. If a Board Member participates in the proceedings on a matter and then abstains from voting, the vote shall be recorded as an affirmative vote on the motion.

4. Voting Order

The order of voting shall be alphabetical, with the exception of the Chairman, who shall vote last.

5. Recording of Votes

The minutes of the Board's proceedings shall show the vote of each member including whether they were absent or failed to vote on a matter considered.

III. APPLICATION PROCESSING

- A. All applications shall be submitted to the office of Community Planning and Building in compliance with the submittal requirements for each specific application. All evidence shall be submitted before the application is determined complete.
- B. Only one (1) application at a time shall be officially received and processed for a specific location.
- C. All applications will be reviewed by staff and will not be further processed until the application has been determined by the staff to be complete. The staff will be responsible for informing the applicant of the deficiencies in the application within thirty (30) working days of receipt of the application.

- D. All staff reports and supporting information shall be reviewed and signed off by the originator of the report and the Director of Community Planning and Building.
- E. When an application is determined to be complete, the application will be scheduled for Board review in the order that the application is received as complete.
- F. Any information received after the Historic Resources Board agenda packet has been distributed may be the basis for continuation of the application.
- G. Any application continued for a second time at the applicants request shall not be continued again but will be re-noticed and advertised for a future Historic Resources Board hearing.

IV. APPEALS AND RECONSIDERATION

- A. Any appeal to the City Council from a decision of the Historic Resources Board must be made by filing a notice of appeal within five (10) working days with the City Clerk.
- B. Any Board member who voted on the prevailing side of a decision may request within five (5) working days of the decision that the matter be reconsidered. The question of whether the action should be considered will be placed on the next Historic Resources Board meeting.
- C. Any applicant may request that a Historic Resources Board decision be reconsidered by the Board. Requests for reconsideration must be made in writing within five (5) working days of the Boards action and state the specific error or omission committed by the Board in the decision, or provide additional, relevant information not considered by the Board.

V. REVIEW AND AMENDMENTS PROCEDURE

- A. These Rules of Procedure shall be reviewed annually.
- B. These Rules of Procedure may be amended or suspended at any meeting of the Historic Resources Board by a majority of the members.



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

May 15, 2023
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO:	Historic Resources Board Commissioners
SUBMITTED BY:	Marnie R. Waffle, AICP, Principal Planner
SUBJECT:	Revised proposal from Historic Resources Board Member Karyl Hall for a new City policy to protect selected non-historic Carmel homes from demolition/exterior remodeling.

RECOMMENDATION:

Receive the report, discuss, and provide direction to staff.

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

At the December 19, 2022, Historic Resources Board meeting, the Board requested a future agenda item to discuss a proposal prepared by Board member Karyl Hall to save select non-historic Carmel homes from demolition/exterior remodeling.

At the January 23, 2023, meeting, the Board reviewed the proposal and directed staff to take the proposal to the City Council to request adding the project to the Community Planning & Building Department's work plan.

Following the meeting, Board member Hall felt it was prudent to clarify some key points of the proposal, and provided staff with a revised proposal for the Board's consideration at the March 20, 2023 meeting. After reviewing and discussing the revised proposal, the Board agreed that further refinements should be made and discussed at a future meeting. Board member Hall has revised proposal which can be found in Attachment 1.

Incentive Program for Selected Non-Historic Carmel Homes

The purpose of the proposed incentive program is to preserve the unique residential architectural character of Carmel-by-the-Sea by saving older homes that reflect that character. The program would be voluntary with certain incentives to encourage property owners to preserve older homes rather than demolish or extensively alter the exterior. The proposal identifies certain qualities that are representative of Carmel's traditional character and encourages additions and alterations that are discreet and subordinate to the original structure.

The proposal is modeled after the City's process for determining whether a property qualifies as historically significant for the local historic inventory but with far fewer requirements. The key requirements are as follows:

- 1) That the home be at least 50 years of age, or less than 50 if it is of exceptional importance...based on its unusually strong contribution to history, architecture, engineering, or culture.
- 2) That the home embodies the distinctive characteristics of a, i) type, ii) period, iii) region, or iv) method of construction, or
- 3) That the home represents the work of a, i) master, ii) an important creative individual, or iii) possesses high artistic values.

Incentives

Potential incentives to encourage participation in the program may include, financial incentives such as reduced planning application fees and/or building permit fees, expedited processing, and/or leniency with the application of certain development standards such as parking, setbacks, tree removals, volumetrics, floor area, etc.

Procedures

Property owners who have submitted a Planning application to demolish an existing home or remodel the exterior who are interested in participating in the program would have their plans reviewed by the Historic Resources Board who would determine whether the project qualifies for Level 2 designation. If the Board unanimously votes no, staff would issue a determination of ineligibility for Level 2 designation.

However, if a majority of the Board supports the Level 2 designation, the restrictions and incentives outlined in the Level 2 proposal would apply. At this time, or at any time prior to approval of the project, the property owner can opt out of the program. Once a project is completed, no additional incentives would be available.

The Level 2 designation would be transferrable upon change of ownership of a property but would not be recorded in the deed for the property.

Promoting the Program

The Level 2 designation could be incorporated into the city's Residential Design Guidelines and promoted in brochures made available to realtors, builders, and the general public at City Hall. It could also be promoted through seminars and videos as well as on the city's website.

FISCAL IMPACT:

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1 - Level 2 Proposal rev05.05.2023

INCENTIVE PROGRAM FOR SELECTED NON-HISTORIC CARMEL HOMES PROPOSED FOR DEMOLITION/EXTERIOR REMODELING

MISSION STATEMENT: To help preserve the unique residential architectural character of Carmel-By-The-Sea with an incentive program to save older homes that reflect that character.

The purpose of this proposal is to establish a new voluntary “Level 2” residential status for homes that do not qualify as “historic,” but nevertheless are characteristic of our village in the forest, with the intent of protecting them from extensive alteration or demolition when possible. This designation would be less restrictive for the homeowner than the standard historic designation (referred to as “Level 1” for our purposes), both in qualifications and remodel requirements, should they choose to take advantage of the program. Incentives will be offered to encourage a Level 2 status.

IDEA STATEMENT: WHY WE NEED PROTECTIONS

Most “Carmel Charmers” and other homes of note do not qualify for historic status (see the criteria for historical register below, Table 1). This is for a variety of reasons, e.g., no record of who built it, the year built, etc. Many of these homes are being torn down, mostly to build larger structures, to utilize “highest and best use” for the owner/investor.

This proposal is an incentive program to encourage homeowners to protect the special nature of Carmel-by-the-Sea. There is a range of architecture consistent with Carmel character (see “Qualifying Characteristics for Level 2 Protection” below, and Appendix A).

Yes, there is some “judgment” in determining which houses qualify for being designated Level 2. That is why we have knowledgeable staff and committees to hash out these decisions. There will always be gray areas requiring judgment calls.

QUALIFYING CHARACTERISTICS FOR LEVEL 2 PROTECTION

1. Homes typically built up through the 1940s (but generally restricted to 50 years or older), including Craftsman, Tudor Revival, English Revival, French Revival, Spanish and Italian Revival, American Colonial Revival, Monterey Revival, and Pueblo Revival. Among the most noteworthy to Carmel in this period was the design of “Storybook” cottages that drew upon references of “Cotswold houses.” The above are generally considered old-world European style homes or traditional styles.

Possible Characteristics include:

- use of natural materials
- attention to detail
- leaded glass windows
- Dutch doors
- wood plank doors
- stone or brick fireplaces
- steep, curving gables
- hand carved trim around windows/doors
- cathedral ceilings
- window boxes, shutters
- intricate stonework
- ironwork accessories
- wood beams—interior and/or exterior
- natural redwood interiors
- board and batten single wall construction
- divided wood framed windows
- rolled roof or wood shingle/shake or slate, clay tile roof, slate, presidential composition, depending on style of home
- dormers/oriels
- open spaces and abundant landscaping
- rough contour Carmel stone
- the use of wood in hand carved doors, window frames, sills, moldings

- details and craftsmanship to create interest and continual delight in the design. surfaces broken up by ridges, insets, decorative tiles, cavities, niches
- corners exhibit bevels, bullnoses, cornices, and moldings
- small paned windows
- fencing that is vertical, grape stake, split rail, stone, irregular/crude
- Arched entries, doors
- Carmel stone walls, stairs, steps
- High peaked roofs
- Natural wood and stone exteriors
- Irregular/distinctive hinge straps on doors
- Subtle soft (amber) lighting and Tudor/Craftsman/Mission style/ wrought iron, wood, or copper lighting fixtures

ref: Alexander, Christopher, Ishikawa, Sara, Silverstein, Murray, “A Pattern Language” 1977, Oxford University Press

2. Homes built by Murphy, Comstock, Denny and Watrous, Hill, Morgan and others listed in the historic register that meet characteristics above. However, a home is not required to have proof/knowledge of builder or restricted to a listed builder/architects to qualify for Level 2 status.

3. Small homes—one and two bedrooms—one story. Saving a small home does not preclude the possibility of adding on in the same vernacular if the addition is designed to be subservient to the original building, ideally hidden from street view if possible.

The proposed Carmel city code changes are consistent with the Level 2 residence proposal (Proposed Zoning Code and Residential Design Guideline amendments, August 21, 2019). Particularly relevant statements from the amendments regarding designs follow:

“...standards have been added requiring that (the home) be sensitive to neighborhood context, incorporate natural finish materials, use earth-toned colors, and to consider using traditional roof forms such as gables.”

TABLE 1: HISTORIC REQUIREMENTS FOR LEVEL 1 HOMES JUXTAPOSED
WITH PROPOSED REQUIREMENTS FOR LEVEL 2 HOMES

HISTORIC REQUIREMENTS (LEVEL 1)	LEVEL 2 HOMES
A. Representative of at least one theme included in the Historic Context Statement.	Not necessary
B. Shall retain substantial integrity (association, feeling, setting, location, design, materials, and workmanship).	Not as restrictive, as long as the basic integrity of the house is maintained
C. Fifty years of age and older, and should meet at least one of the four criteria for listing in the CA Register at a national or statewide level of significance, or at a regional or local level of significance:	Same for age
1. Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history or the cultural heritage of CA or the U.S.	Not necessary
2. Is associated with the lives of persons important to local, CA or national history	Not necessary
3. Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region, or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, an important creative individual, or possesses high artistic values, Or	Same
4. Has yielded, or has the potential to yield, information important to the prehistory or history of the local area, CA or the nation.	Not necessary

D. To qualify for the Carmel Inventory, an historic resource eligible under CA Register criteria no. 3 only, should:

- | | |
|---|---------------|
| 1. Have been designed and/or constructed by an architect, designer/builder or contractor whose work has contributed to the unique sense of time and place recognized as significant in the Historic Context Statement, or | Not necessary |
| 2. Have been designed and/or constructed by a previously unrecognized architect, designer/builder, or contractor if there is substantial, factual evidence that the one or more of the historic contexts of the city to an extent consistent with other architects, etc. identified within the Historic Context Statement, or | Not necessary |
| 3. Be a good example of an architectural style or type of construction recognized as significant in the Historic Context Statement, or | Not necessary |
| 4. Display a rare style or type for which special consideration should be given. Rare styles and types that contribute to Carmel's unique sense of time and place shall be deemed significant. | Not necessary |

E., F, and G.
Not applicable

H. A resource less than 50 years old may be eligible if it is of exceptional importance to the city, state or nation, based on its unusually strong contribution to history architecture, engineering, or culture, or because it is an integral part of an historic district.	Same
---	------

PROPOSED ALLOWANCES (INCENTIVES) FOR LEVEL 2 HOMES

The Level 2 designation could be a badge of honor, further enhancing the value of the residence, if financial and/or code amendment incentives were provided. Indeed, incentives would be the motivation for participation in most cases. Possible incentives follow:

1. Allow additions to existing homes while keeping the original home intact, using the same style of construction as the original.
2. Allow upgrades inside the home while maintaining the exterior appearance.
3. Allow replacement of existing structure(s) where necessary (due to extensive wood rot, code compliance issues, etc.) in the same construction style/size as the original, using as many of the original home materials as possible.
4. Reduced planning fees and city permits once the Level 2 designation is assigned.
5. Fast-track the permit process.
6. leniency regarding the following:
 - flexibility in requirements for a home built before today's codes existed (illegal non-conforming issues)
 - Parking requirements
 - Basement
 - Setback requirements
 - Tree removal
 - Volumetrics
 - Allow a larger addition than standard if subordinate
 - Floor area ratio
 - Drainage requirements

- * Note: The current building restrictions and requirements give no leeway for older homes. Ideally there would be a mechanism for the city planners to apply site-specific criteria with which the Level 2 homeowner could work. Any non-financial incentive would require code amendments for Level 2 homes.

STEPS TO ESTABLISH LEVEL 2 HOMES

1. A project would only be referred to the HRB by the city planning staff if the applicant elects to participate in the program. The planning department staff would pass along to the HRB only cases for review for which the applicant desires to participate, and that alter the exterior of the home. This includes all homes for which permit applications for exterior remodels or demolition have been submitted that are not designated historic and are fifty or more years of age. Excluded are plans only for deck and patio additions/changes, landscaping changes, and roof or other repairs/replacement, if replaced with like-kind materials.
2. Candidates identified who are interested in participating would have their homes reviewed by the Historic Resources Board (HRB). The HRB would then make the determination of qualification for a Level 2 home, similar to the procedures for Level 1 (historic) homes.
3. If there is a unanimous “non-approval” by the HRB, staff would proceed as they have in the past, with “determination of ineligibility” established.
If a majority of HRB board members approve Level 2 status, the restrictions and incentives delineated in this proposal apply, should the owner decide to participate.
4. If a home is designated Level 2, the homeowner(s) could, if desired, meet with the HRB, to discuss their concerns/incentives with the designation and how it could impact their plans for the property. Otherwise, they would simply work with the planning department regarding incentives. The owner has the option of not accepting the designation before final plans are approved by the Design

Review Board, Planning Department or Planning Commission, whichever apply.

5. It becomes the responsibility of the Staff/Planning Commission to enforce restrictions for homes designated as Level 2, should the owner take advantage of the program.

Level 2 designation would exist through the property to new owners via city records, but not through deed restrictions. A new owner of an already Level 2 designated home could retain the Level 2 designation/incentives that had been originally applied, but would not be able to utilize the designation for additional incentives, i.e., level 2 incentives apply only once on a home. It is unlikely that a subsequent owner would demolish or extensively remodel a home that has a Level 2 qualified remodel or rebuild by the prior owner. Needless to say, designated historic homes do not qualify for Level 2 incentives.

WAYS TO PROMOTE THE PROGRAM:

- Level 2 program listed/described in the Design Guidelines
- Brochure for realtors, builders, public, at city hall – a method for notifying of the possibility of level two home designation*
- Seminars, video
- City website list of examples of Level 2 homes and requirements (This document could be made available online to every potential buyer of homes)

kh: revised 5.5.23

CHECKLIST: REQUIREMENTS FOR LEVEL 2 HOMES

_____ A. Any external plan changes before the Planning Department for a home 50 years old or older is to be considered for historic status or Level 2 status by the HRB. FOR DISCUSSION!

_____ A. Is representative of at least one traditional historic theme
(needn't be an exact representation).

_____ B. Has basic integrity (association, feeling, setting, location,
design, materials, and/or workmanship).

_____ C. Is fifty years of age or older
(A resource less than 50 years old may be eligible if it is of
exceptional importance to the city, state, or nation, based on
its contribution to history, architecture, engineering, or
culture, or
because it is an integral part of an historic district)..

_____ D. Embodies the character of a cottage in a village in the forest
(see "Qualifying Characteristics for Level 2 Protection" and
Appendix A in proposal.

_____ E. Building plans involve changes beyond deck and patio additions or
changes, landscaping changes, and roof or other repairs or
replacements in-kind.

Appendix A





CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

May 15, 2023
ADJOURNMENT

TO: Historic Resources Board Commissioners

SUBMITTED BY: Leah Young, Administrative Coordinator

SUBJECT: PUBLIC CORRESPONDENCE: Items on the Agenda

RECOMMENDATION:

N/A

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

N/A

FISCAL IMPACT:

N/A

ATTACHMENTS:



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD Staff Report

May 15, 2023
ADJOURNMENT

TO: Historic Resources Board Commissioners

SUBMITTED BY: Leah Young, Administrative Coordinator

SUBJECT: PUBLIC CORRESPONDENCE: Additional Items Not Associated with Items on the Agenda

RECOMMENDATION:

N/A

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

N/A

FISCAL IMPACT:

N/A

ATTACHMENTS: